## Exhibit 12

Case 1:12-cv-03461-PKC Document 1-14 Filed 05/01/12s. Department of Hameland Security

RECEIVED

APR 1 3 2012

MOREISON & FOERSTER

U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services

April 9, 2012

APP2012000272

HQ FOIA/PA Appeals

150 Space Center Loop, Suite 500 Lee's Summit, MO 64064-2139

Jason A. Malinsky Morrison and Foerster, LLP 425 Market Street San Francisco, CA 94105-2482

Dear Mr. Malinsky:

Re: COW2011000600

You appealed the action of the National Records Center regarding your request for access to records pertaining to Overseas Tracking System, dated July 25, 2011. The original determination of the National Records Center was to withhold 138 pages in part and 25 in full.

After careful consideration of your appeal, we have decided to affirm the initial action in this case. We have determined that the National Records Center properly withheld certain information that is protected from disclosure under the Freedom of Information Act and that this information is not appropriate for discretionary release.

If you are dissatisfied with our action on your appeal, you may seek judicial review in accordance with 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(4)(B). The Office of Government Information Services (OGIS) also mediates disputes between FOIA requesters and Federal agencies as a non-exclusive alternative to litigation. The OGIS does not have the authority to handle requests made under the Privacy Act of 1974. If you wish to contact OGIS, you may email them at ogis@nara.gov or call 1-877-684-6448.

Sincerely,

Alan D. Hughes, Associate Counsel

Commercial and Administrative Law Division

Department of Homeland Security

Citizenship and Immigration Services